



<http://dx.doi.org/10.11646/zootaxa.3795.5.2>

<http://zoobank.org/urn:lsid:zoobank.org:pub:9394634C-9836-4973-868B-BDEE414E4EA8>

A revision of African helmeted terrapins (Testudines: Pelomedusidae: *Pelomedusa*), with descriptions of six new species

ALICE PETZOLD¹, MARIO VARGAS-RAMÍREZ¹, CHRISTIAN KEHLMAIER¹, MELITA VAMBERGER¹, WILLIAM R. BRANCH^{2,3}, LOUIS DU PREEZ⁴, MARGARETHA D. HOFMEYER⁵, LEON MEYER⁴, ALFRED SCHLEICHER⁶, PAVEL ŠIROKÝ⁷ & UWE FRITZ^{1,*}

¹Museum of Zoology, Senckenberg Dresden, A. B. Meyer Building, 01109 Dresden, Germany

²Department of Herpetology, Port Elizabeth Museum, P.O. Box 13147, Humewood 6013, South Africa

³Department of Zoology, P.O. Box 77000, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University, Port Elizabeth 6031, South Africa

⁴Unit for Environmental Science & Management, North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Private Bag X6001, Potchefstroom 2520, South Africa

⁵Chelonian Biodiversity and Conservation, Department of Biodiversity and Conservation Biology, University of the Western Cape, Private Bag X17, Bellville 7535, South Africa

⁶P.O. Box 30566, Windhoek, Namibia

⁷Department of Biology and Wildlife Diseases, Faculty of Veterinary Hygiene and Ecology, University of Veterinary and Pharmaceutical Sciences, Palackého tř. 1/3, 612 42 Brno, Czech Republic

*Corresponding author. E-mail: uwe.fritz@senckenberg.de

Abstract

Using nearly range-wide sampling, we analyze up to 1848 bp of mitochondrial DNA of 183 helmeted terrapins and identify a minimum of 12 deeply divergent species-level clades. Uncorrected *p* distances of these clades equal or clearly exceed those between the currently recognized species of *Pelusios*, the genus most closely related to *Pelomedusa*. We correlate genetic discontinuities of *Pelomedusa* with data on morphology and endoparasites and describe six new *Pelomedusa* species. Moreover, we restrict the name *Pelomedusa subrufa* (Bonnaterre, 1789) to one genetic lineage and resurrect three further species from its synonymy, namely *P. galeata* (Schoepff, 1792), *P. gehafie* (Rüppell, 1835), and *P. olivacea* (Schweigger, 1812). In addition to these ten *Pelomedusa* species, we identify two further clades from Cameroon and Sudan with similar levels of genetic divergence that remain unnamed candidate species. We also note that some problematical terrapins from South Africa and Somalia may represent two additional candidate species. Some of the *Pelomedusa* species are morphologically distinctive, whilst others can only be identified by molecular markers and are therefore morphologically cryptic taxa.

Key words: Africa, Arabian Peninsula, integrative taxonomy, Madagascar, nomenclature, Reptilia, revision, species description

Introduction

Species delimitation has been flagged as a Renaissance issue in zoology (Sites & Marshall 2003), and to this end new DNA-based approaches have been developed (see the reviews in Carstens *et al.* 2013; Miralles & Vences 2013). Basically, two major approaches have gained much attention. One, DNA barcoding (e.g. Hebert *et al.* 2003), relies on genetic distances of typically a single marker gene, whilst the later proposed multilocus coalescent-based methods (e.g. Yang & Rannala 2010) seem at first glance much more sophisticated. It is well known that DNA barcoding suffers from several shortcomings, such as relying on a single (mitochondrial) marker and a rigid threshold for inferring species status. Moreover, hybridization, introgression, paralogues (in particular numts), incomplete sorting and recently split species pose serious challenges (e.g. Meyer & Paulay 2005; Galtier *et al.* 2009). For these reasons, DNA barcoding has been severely criticized as massive oversimplification (e.g. Will &

Supporting Information

REFERENCE ALIGNMENT. 12S rRNA sequences (FASTA format) for *Pelomedusa* species.

TABLE S1. Used samples, GenBank sequences and their accession numbers.

TABLE S2. Evolutionary models selected by the Bayesian Information Criterion in PARTITIONFINDER (Lanfear *et al.* 2012).

The Supporting Information is available from the Dryad Repository using the link <http://dx.doi.org/10.5061/dryad.288ft>

References

- Barlow, A., Baker, K., Hendry, C.R., Peppin, L., Phelps, T., Tolley, K.A., Wüster, C.E. & Wüster, W. (2013) Phylogeography of the widespread African puff adder (*Bitis arietans*) reveals multiple Pleistocene refugia in southern Africa. *Molecular Ecology*, 22, 1134–1157.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/mec.12157>
- Bonnaterre, P.J. (1789) *Tableau encyclopédique et méthodique des trois règnes de la nature. Erpétologie*. Panckoucke, Hôtel de Thou, Paris, xxviii + 70 + (1) pp., 35 plates.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.59326>
- Boycott, R.C. & Bourquin, O. (2008) *Pelomedusa subrufa* (Lacépède 1788), helmeted turtle, helmeted terrapin. In: Rhodin, A.G.J., Pritchard, P.C.H., van Dijk, P.P., Saumure, R.A., Buhlmann, K.A. & Iverson, J.B. (Eds.), *Conservation Biology of Freshwater Turtles and Tortoises: A Compilation Project of the IUCN/SSC Tortoise and Freshwater Turtle Specialist Group. Chelonian Research Monographs, No. 5*. Chelonian Research Foundation, Lunenburg, MA, pp. 007.1–007.6.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.3854/crm.5.007.subrufa.v1.2008>
- Branch, B. (2008) *Tortoises, Terrapins & Turtles of Africa*. Struik Publishers, Cape Town, 128 pp.
- Branch, W.R., Baard, E.H.W. & De Villiers, A. (1990) Some exceptionally large Southern African chelonians. *Journal of the Herpetological Association of Africa*, 37, 53–54.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/04416651.1990.9650264>
- Bull, J.J. & Legler, J.M. (1980) Karyotypes of side-necked turtles (Testudines: Pleurodira). *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 58, 828–841.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1139/z80-115>
- Carstens, B.C., Pelletier, T.A., Reid, N.M. & Satler, J.D. (2013) How to fail at species delimitation. *Molecular Ecology*, 22, 4369–4383.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/mec.12413>
- Dayrat, B. (2005) Towards integrative taxonomy. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 85, 407–415.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8312.2005.00503.x>
- Dikow, R.B. & Smith, W.L. (2013) Complete genome sequences provide a case study for the evaluation of gene-tree thinking. *Cladistics*, 29, 672–682.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/cla.12020>
- Donndorff, J.A. (1798) *Zoologische Beyträge zur XIII. Ausgabe des Linnéischen Natursystems. Dritter Band. Amphibien und Fische*. Weidmannsche Buchhandlung, Leipzig, VI + 980 pp., Errata.
- Duméril, A.M.C. & Bibron, G. (1835) *Erpétologie générale ou histoire naturelle complète des reptiles. Tome second*. Librairie encyclopédique de Roret, Paris, 680 pp.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.46831>
- Du Preez, L.H. & Lim, L.H.S. (2000) *Neopolystoma liewi* sp. n. (Monogenea: Polystomatidae) from the eye of the Malayan box turtle (*Cuora amboinensis*). *Folia Parasitologica*, 47, 11–16.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.14411/fp.2000.003>
- Euzet, L. & Combes, C. (1965) Parasites des chéloniens malgaches. *Polystomoides chabaudi* n. sp. (Monogenea) chez la tortue d'eau douce *Pelomedusa subrufa* Lacépède 1788. *Annales de Parasitologie Humaine et Comparée*, 40, 455–450.
- Fritz, U. (1995) Zur innerartlichen Variabilität von *Emys orbicularis* (Linnaeus, 1758). 5a. Taxonomie in Mittel-Westeuropa, auf Korsika, Sardinien, der Apenninen-Halbinsel und Sizilien und Unterartengruppen von *E. orbicularis*. *Zoologische Abhandlungen*, 48, 185–242.
- Fritz, U., Alcalde, L., Vargas-Ramírez, M., Goode, E.V., Fabius-Turoblin, D.U. & Praschag, P. (2012a) Northern genetic richness and southern purity, but just one species in the *Chelonoidis chilensis* complex. *Zoologica Scripta*, 41, 220–232.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1463-6409.2012.00533.x>
- Fritz, U., Branch, W.R., Gehring, P.-S., Harvey, J., Kindler, C., Meyer, L., Du Preez, L., Široký, P., Vieites, D.R. & Vences, M. (2013) Weak divergence among African, Malagasy and Seychellois hinged terrapins (*Pelusios castanoides*, *P. subniger*) and evidence for human-mediated oversea dispersal. *Organisms Diversity & Evolution*, 13, 215–224.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s13127-012-0113-3>
- Fritz, U., Branch, W.R., Hofmeyr, M.D., Maran, J., Prokop, H., Schleicher, A., Široký, P., Stuckas, H., Vargas-Ramírez, M., Vences, M. & Hundsdörfer, A.K. (2011) Molecular phylogeny of African hinged and helmeted terrapins (Testudines:

- Pelomedusidae: *Pelusios* and *Pelomedusa*). *Zoologica Scripta*, 40, 115–125.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1463-6409.2010.00464.x>
- Fritz, U., d'Angelo, S., Pennisi, M.G. & Lo Valvo, M. (2006) Variation of Sicilian pond turtles, *Emys trinacris* – What makes a species cryptic? *Amphibia-Reptilia*, 27, 513–529.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/156853806778877095>
- Fritz, U., Fattizzo, T., Guicking, D., Tripepi, S., Pennisi, M.G., Lenk, P., Joger, U. & Wink, M. (2005) A new cryptic species of pond turtle from southern Italy, the hottest spot in the range of the genus *Emys*. *Zoologica Scripta*, 34, 351–371.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1463-6409.2005.00188.x>
- Fritz, U., Guicking, D., Auer, M., Sommer, R.S., Wink, M. & Hundsdoerfer, A.K. (2008) Diversity of the Southeast Asian leaf turtle genus *Cyclemys*: how many leaves on its tree of life? *Zoologica Scripta*, 37, 367–390.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1463-6409.2008.00332.x>
- Fritz, U., Petzold, A., Kehlmaier, C., Kindler, C., Campbell, P., Hofmeyr, M.D. & Branch, W.R. (2014) Disentangling the *Pelomedusa* complex using type specimens and historical DNA. *Zootaxa*, 3795 (5), 501–522
<http://dx.doi.org/10.11646/zootaxa.3795.5.1>
- Fritz, U., Stuckas, H., Vargas-Ramírez, M., Hundsdoerfer, A.K., Maran, J. & Päckert, M. (2012b) Molecular phylogeny of Central and South American slider turtles: implications for biogeography and systematics (Testudines: Emydidae: *Trachemys*). *Journal of Zoological Systematics and Evolutionary Research*, 50, 125–136.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1439-0469.2011.00647.x>
- Fritz, U., Vargas-Ramírez, M. & Široký, P. (2012c) Phylogenetic position of *Pelusios williamsi* and a critique of current GenBank procedures (Reptilia: Testudines: Pelomedusidae). *Amphibia-Reptilia*, 33, 150–154.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/156853812x627204>
- Galtier, N., Nabholz, B., Glémin, S. & Hurst, G.D.D. (2009) Mitochondrial DNA as a marker of molecular diversity: a reappraisal. *Molecular Ecology*, 18, 4541–4550.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-294x.2009.04380.x>
- Gasperetti, J., Stimson, A.F., Miller, J.D., Ross, J.P. & Gasperetti, P.R. (1993) Turtles of Arabia. *Fauna of Saudi Arabia*, 13, 170–367.
- Gray, J.E. (1863) Notice of a new species of *Pelomedusa* from Natal. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History*, 3 (12), 99–100.
- Hebert, P.D.N., Cywinska, A., Ball, S.L. & DeWaard, J.R. (2003) Biological identifications through DNA barcodes. *Proceedings of the Royal Society London, B (Biological Sciences)*, 270, 313–321.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2002.2218>
- Hewitt, J. (1935) Some new forms of batrachians and reptiles from South Africa. *Records of the Albany Museum*, 4, 283–357, plates XXVII–XXXVI.
- ICZN [International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature] (1999) *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature. Fourth Edition*. International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London, XXIX + 306 pp.
- Iverson, J.B., Le, M. & Ingram, C. (2013) Molecular phylogenetics of the mud and musk turtle family Kinosternidae. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 69, 929–939.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.06.011>
- Kindler, C., Branch, W.R., Hofmeyr, M.D., Maran, J., Široký, P., Vences, M., Harvey, J., Hauswaldt, J.S., Schleicher, A., Stuckas, H. & Fritz, U. (2012) Molecular phylogeny of African hinge-back tortoises (*Kinixys*): implications for phylogeography and taxonomy (Testudines: Testudinidae). *Journal of Zoological Systematics and Evolutionary Research*, 50, 192–201.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1439-0469.2012.00660.x>
- Kulo, S.-D. (1980) Parasites de chéloniens en Afrique intertropicale. *Polystomoides nabedei* n. sp. (Monogenea, Polystomatidae), parasite de la vessie urinaire de la tortue d'eau douce *Pelomedusa subrufa* Lacépède, 1788 (Chélonien, Pelomedusidae). *Annales de Parasitologie Humaine et Comparée*, 55, 367–377.
- Lamb, T., Lydeard, C., Walker, R.B. & Gibbons, J.W. (1994) Molecular systematics of map turtles (*Graptemys*): a comparison of mitochondrial restriction site versus sequence data. *Systematic Biology*, 43, 543–559.
- Lanfear, R., Calcott, B., Ho, S.Y.W. & Guindon, S. (2012) PARTITIONFINDER: combined selection of partitioning schemes and substitution models for phylogenetic analyses. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 29, 1695–1701.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/molbev/mss020>
- Mertens, R. (1937) Bemerkungen über die Rassen von *Pelomedusa subrufa* (La Cépède). *Zoologischer Anzeiger*, 117, 139–142.
- Meyer, C.P. & Paulay, G. (2005) DNA barcodes: error rates based on comprehensive sampling. *PLoS Biology*, 3, e422.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.0030422>
- Miralles, A. & Vences, M. (2013) New metrics for comparison of taxonomies reveal striking discrepancies among species delimitation methods in *Madascincus* lizards. *PLoS ONE*, 8, e68242.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0068242>
- Morrison, C. & Du Preez, L.H. (2011) *Turtle Polystomes of the World. Neopolystoma, Polystomoidella and Polystomoides*. VDM Verlag Dr. Müller, Saarbrücken, 236 pp.
- Padial, J.M., Miralles, A., De la Riva, I. & Vences, M. (2010) The integrative future of taxonomy. *Frontiers in Zoology*, 7, 16.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/1742-9994-7-16>

- Praschag, P., Stuckas, H., Päckert, M., Maran, J. & Fritz, U. (2011) Mitochondrial DNA sequences suggest a revised taxonomy of Asian flapshell turtles (*Lissemys* Smith, 1931) and the validity of previously unrecognized taxa (Testudines: Trionychidae). *Vertebrate Zoology*, 61, 147–160.
- Rochebrune, A.-T. de (1884) *Faune de la Sénégambe. Reptiles*. Octave Doin, Paris, 41 + (1) pp., 8 plates.
- Ronquist, F., Teslenko, M., van der Mark, P., Ayres, D.L., Darling, A., Höhna, S., Larget, B., Liu, L., Suchard, M.A. & Huelsenbeck, J.P. (2012) MrBayes 3.2: efficient Bayesian phylogenetic inference and model choice across a large model space. *Systematic Biology*, 61, 539–542.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/sys029>
- Rüppell, E. (1835) *Neue Wirbelthiere zu der Fauna von Abyssinien gehörig. Amphibien*. Siegmund Schmerber, Frankfurt am Main, 18 pp., 6 plates.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.53778>
- Schlick-Steiner, B., Steiner, F.M., Seifert, B., Stauffer, C., Christian, E. & Crozier, R.H. (2010) Integrative taxonomy: a multisource approach to exploring biodiversity. *Annual Review of Entomology*, 55, 421–438.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1146/annurev-ento-112408-085432>
- Schoepff, I.D. (1792) *Historia Testudinum iconibus illustrata*. Ioannes Iacobus Palm, Erlangen, XII + 136 pp., 31 plates.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.5109>
- Schweigger, [A.F.] (1812) Prodrromus monographiae Cheloniorum. In: Bessel, F.W., Hagen, K.G., Remer, W.H.G., Schweigger, A.F. & Wrede, E.F. (Eds.), *Königsberger Archiv für Naturwissenschaft und Mathematik. Erster Band*. Friedrich Nicolovius, Königsberg, pp. 271–368 + 406–462.
- Schweinfurth, G. (1874) *Im Herzen von Afrika. Reisen und Entdeckungen im centralen Aequatorial-Afrika während der Jahre 1868 bis 1871*. Volume 1 and 2. F.A. Brockhaus, Leipzig, XIII + 599 pp. (Vol. 1), XII + 561 pp., 2 maps (Vol. 2).
- Shen, Y.-Y., Chen, X. & Murphy, R.W. (2013) Assessing DNA barcoding as a tool for species identification and data quality control. *PLoS ONE*, 8, e57125.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0057125>
- Sites, J.W. & Marshall, J.C. (2003) Delimiting species: a Renaissance issue in systematic biology. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, 18, 462–470.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/s0169-5347\(03\)00184-8](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/s0169-5347(03)00184-8)
- Spinks, P.Q., Thomson, R.C., Pauly, G.B., Newman, C.E., Mount, G. & Shaffer, H.B. (2013) Misleading phylogenetic inferences based on single-exemplar sampling in the turtle genus *Pseudemys*. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 68, 269–281.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.03.031>
- Spinks, P.Q., Thomson, R.C., Zhang, Y., Che, J., Wu, Y. & Shaffer, H.B. (2012) Species boundaries and phylogenetic relationships in the critically endangered Asian box turtle genus *Cuora*. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 63, 656–667.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2012.02.014>
- Stamatakis, A. (2006) RAxML-VI-HPC: maximum likelihood-based phylogenetic analyses with thousands of taxa and mixed models. *Bioinformatics*, 22, 2688–2690.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btl446>
- Stuckas, H. & Fritz, U. (2011) Identity of *Pelodiscus sinensis* revealed by DNA sequences of an approximately 180-year-old type specimen and a taxonomic reappraisal of *Pelodiscus* species (Testudines: Trionychidae). *Journal of Zoological Systematics and Evolutionary Research*, 49, 335–339.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1439-0469.2011.00632.x>
- Stuckas, H., Gemel, R. & Fritz, U. (2013) One extinct turtle species less: *Pelusios seychellensis* is not extinct, it never existed. *PLoS ONE*, 8, e57116.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0057116>
- Suckow, G.A. (1798) *Anfangsgründe der theoretischen und angewandten Naturgeschichte der Thiere. Dritter Theil. Von den Amphibien*. Weidmannische Buchhandlung, Leipzig, 298 pp.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.62582>
- Tamura, K., Stecher, G., Peterson, D., Filipiński, A. & Kumar, S. (2013) MEGA6: Molecular Evolutionary Genetics Analysis version 6.0. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 30, 2725–2729.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/molbev/mst197>
- Tinsley, R.C. (1973) Observations on Polystomatidae (Monogeneoidea) from East Africa with a description of *Polystoma makereri* n. sp. *Zeitschrift für Parasitenkunde*, 42, 251–263.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/bf00328887>
- Todd, E.V., Blair, D. & Jerry, D.R. (2014) Influence of drainage divides versus arid corridors on genetic structure and demography of a widespread freshwater turtle, *Emydura macquarii krefftii*, from Australia. *Ecology and Evolution*, 4, 606–622.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/ece3.968>
- Vaillant, L. & Grandidier, G. (1910) Volume XVII. Histoire naturelle des reptiles. Première partie: Crocodiles et tortues. In: Grandidier, A. & Grandidier, G. (Eds.), *Histoire physique, naturelle et politique de Madagascar*. Imprimerie Nationale, Paris, pp. 1–86, plates 1–27.

- Vargas-Ramírez, M., Carr, J.L. & Fritz, U. (2013) Complex phylogeography in *Rhinoclemmys melanosterna*: conflicting mitochondrial and nuclear evidence suggests past hybridization (Testudines: Geoemydidae). *Zootaxa*, 3670 (2), 238–254. <http://dx.doi.org/10.11646/zootaxa.3670.2.8>
- Vargas-Ramírez, M., Michels, J., Castaño-Mora, O.V., Cárdenas-Arevalo, G., Gallego-García, N. & Fritz, U. (2012) Weak genetic divergence between the two South American toad-headed turtles *Mesoclemmys dahli* and *M. zuliae* (Testudines: Pleurodira: Chelidae). *Amphibia-Reptilia*, 33, 373–385. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/15685381-00002840>
- Vargas-Ramírez, M., Vences, M., Branch, W.R., Daniels, S.R., Glaw, F., Hofmeyr, M.D., Kuchling, G., Maran, J., Papenfuss, T.J., Šíroký, P., Vieites, D.R. & Fritz, U. (2010) Deep genealogical lineages in the widely distributed African helmeted terrapin: evidence from mitochondrial and nuclear DNA (Testudines: Pelomedusidae: *Pelomedusa subrufa*). *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 56, 428–440. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2010.03.019>
- Will, K.W., Mishler, B.D. & Wheeler, Q.D. (2005) The perils of DNA barcoding and the need for integrative taxonomy. *Systematic Biology*, 54, 844–851. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10635150500354878>
- Will, K.W. & Rubinoff, D. (2004) Myth of the molecule: DNA barcodes for species cannot replace morphology for identification and classification. *Cladistics*, 20, 47–55. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1096-0031.2003.00008.x>
- Wong, R.A., Fong, J.J. & Papenfuss, T.J. (2010) Phylogeography of the African helmeted terrapin, *Pelomedusa subrufa*: genetic structure, dispersal, and human introduction. *Proceedings of the California Academy of Sciences*, 61, 575–585.
- Yang, Z. & Rannala, B. (2010) Bayesian species delimitation using multilocus sequence data. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA*, 107, 9264–9269. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0913022107>