

Taxonomic reassessment of *Gracilaria cearensis* (Rhodophyta, Gracilariales), a poorly defined yet common flattened species based on morphological and molecular analysis including topotype collections

LUANDA PEREIRA SOARES^{1,5*}, CARLOS FREDERICO D. GURGEL^{2,3,4} & MUTUE TOYOTA FUJII⁵

¹ Post-Graduate Program “Biodiversidade Vegetal e Meio Ambiente”, Instituto de Botânica, Av. Miguel Estéfano, 3687, São Paulo, SP, 04301-902, Brazil

² Departamento de Botânica, Centro de Ciências Biológicas, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Florianópolis, SC, 88040-970, Brazil

³ School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, The University of Adelaide, Adelaide, SA 5005, Australia

⁴ State Herbarium of South Australia, DEWNR, South Australia Government, PO Box 2732, Kent Town, SA 5071, Australia

⁵ Instituto de Botânica, Núcleo de Pesquisa em Ficologia, São Paulo, SP, 04301-902, Brazil

* Corresponding author: luanda87@gmail.com

Abstract

The genus *Gracilaria* is the major source of agarose in the world today and is one of the most species-rich genera in the Rhodophyta. Flat *Gracilaria* species are among the most taxonomically challenging taxa due to their widespread phenotypic plasticity among all species. *Gracilaria cearensis* is a flat species described in 1965 from Brazil. Its original description is not conducive to accurate taxonomic identifications and the delineation of this taxon remains elusive. New samples of *G. cearensis* were collected across a coastal length of 500 km including its type locality. Universal Plastid Amplicon (UPA) and the *rbcL* gene were used to confirm the phylogenetic and taxonomic status of this poorly known species. Results showed that this is a distinct species despite morphological similarities to *G. hayi*, *G. cuneata*, *G. curtissiae*, *G. brasiliensis* and *G. galetensis*. *G. cearensis* is sister to *G. hayi* yet the genetic divergence between these two species was 2% for *rbcL* and 1.08% for UPA, enough to consider them distinct taxa. However, newly generated molecular data placed *G. smithsoniensis*, another morphologically similar species, as conspecific with *G. cearensis* with only 0.07% *rbcL* sequence divergence between them.

Key words: biodiversity, *rbcL*, taxonomy, UPA

Introduction

Gracilaria cearensis (A.B. Joly & F.C. Pinheiro 1965: 81) A.B. Joly & F.C. Pinheiro (1966: 131) is a tropical intertidal species with flat, strap-shaped branched thalli and commonly occurring in shallow reefs along the northeastern Brazilian coast (Pinheiro-Vieira & Ferreira 1968). In Brazil, *G. cearensis* has industrial potential as a source of agar and has attracted biotechnological interest due to its hemagglutination and antibiotic activity (Pinheiro-Vieira & Caland-Noronha 1971, Ainouz & Sampaio 1991).

The species was originally described as *Tylotus cearensis* Joly & Pinheiro (1965: 81) based on material collected in Fortaleza, Ceará state, Brazil. The genus *Tylotus* J. Agardh (1876: 428) was excluded from the Gracilariaceae by Dawson (1949) based on the presence of zonate tetrasporangia in the type species, *T. obtusatus* (Sonder 1845: 56) J. Agardh (1876: 428). Later, Pinheiro & Joly (1966) transferred *T. cearensis* to *Gracilaria* Greville (1830: 121) in the light of its cruciately divided tetrasporangia. *G. cearensis* shows other main characters such as tubular nutritive cells present in both pericarp and the cystocarp floor, and spermatangial conceptacles described as “usually not confluent” as observed in most *Gracilaria* species. Since its description no further taxonomic or morphological studies have been performed in order to ascertain the status of this taxon, despite its purportedly widespread distribution in northeastern Brazil, from Ceará (Joly & Pinheiro 1965) to Bahia state (Nunes 2005).

Morphologically, *G. cearensis* is similar to *G. brasiliensis* Gurgel & Yoneshigue-Valentin (2008: 255), *G. cuneata* Areschoug (1854: 351), *G. galetensis* Gurgel, Fredericq & J. Norris (2004: 181), *G. hayi* Gurgel, Fredericq & J. Norris

cortex and medulla. Our morphological analysis showed that this feature is variable even in the same specimen, depending on sectioned part of the thallus. Among Brazilian specimens of *G. cearensis*, plants with different thallus width can be observed, including specimens from the type locality. Some of the smallest specimens can be easily confused with *G. smithsoniensis*. Allied to these observations, the *rbcL* sequences of *G. smithsoniensis* and *G. cearensis* placed these two species in a single clade with an uncorrected genetic divergence of only 0.07% suggesting that *G. smithsoniensis* is a morphological variant of *G. cearensis*. In the light of the results herein, we propose the synonymy of *G. smithsoniensis* with *G. cearensis*.

Molecular data have continued advancing the taxonomy of flat *Gracilaria* species around the world. *Gracilaria cuneata* is a name that has been used extensively to identify large, flat *Gracilaria* specimens in the western Atlantic Ocean. However, based on molecular-assisted phylogenetic analyses, Gurgel *et al.* (2004) described *G. hayi* based on material from Caribbean Panama previously identified as *G. cuneata* and *G. cearensis* could be considered a synonym of *G. cuneata* based on the results obtained by Bellorin *et al.* (2002). Our results supported the former but rejected the latter hypothesis, and showed that *G. cearensis*, *G. cuneata* and *G. hayi* are three morphologically and molecularly distinct species.

Conclusion

Field identifications of flat Gracilariaceae species are often difficult due to the wide morphological variability and phenotypic overlap among taxa. Consequently, we are moving towards a taxonomic practice where only combined molecular and morphological analyses allow the characterization and precise identification of closely related species. Under this modern framework this study was the first to provide molecular data from *G. cearensis*, revise its taxonomy and contribute to a better understanding of the systematics of the genus *Gracilaria* in the western Atlantic Ocean.

Acknowledgements

This work was partially supported by research grants from Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq - Proc. 484647/2012-1), and by “Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa de São Paulo” (FAPESP—Proc. 2012/18775-6). MTF thanks CNPq for Productivity Fellowship (Proc. 303915/2013-7). LPS thanks Coordenação de Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior (CAPES, Brazil) for the PhD fellowship (Proc. Nº 23038.000077/2010-38). The authors are grateful to Pedro Carneiro and Cecília Kano for field support.

References

- Abbott, I.A. (1985) New species of *Gracilaria* Grev. (Gracilariaceae, Rhodophyta) from California and Hawaii. In: Abbott, I.A. & Norris, J.N. (Eds.) *Taxonomy of economic seaweeds with reference to some Pacific and Caribbean species*. Vol. I, California Sea Grant College Program, pp. 115–121.
- Agardh, C.A. (1820) *Icones algarum ineditae. Fasc. 1*. Officina Berlingiana, Lund, 4 pp.
- Agardh, C.A. (1822) *Species algarum rite cognitae, cum synonymis, differentiis specificis et descriptionibus succinctis. Volumen primum pars posterior*. Officina Berlingiana, Lund, 229 pp.
- Agardh, J.G. (1847) Nya alger från Mexico. *Öfversigt af Kongl. Vetenskaps-Akademiens Förhandlingar, Stockholm* 4: 5–17.
- Agardh, J.G. (1852) *Species genera et ordines algarum, seu descriptiones succinctae specierum, generum et ordinum, quibus algarum regnum constituitur. Volumis secundi: Algas florideas complectens. Part 2, fasc. 2*. C.W.K. Gleerup, Lund, 123 pp.
- Agardh, J.G. (1876) *Species genera et ordines algarum, seu descriptiones succinctae specierum, generum et ordinum, quibus algarum regnum constituitur. Volumen tertium: de Florideis curae posteriores. Part 1*. C.W.K. Gleerup, Leipzig, 724 pp.
- Agardh, J.G. (1885) Till algerne systematik. Nya bidrag. (Fjerde afdelningen.). *Lunds Universitets Års-Skrift, Afdelningen for Matematik och Naturvetenskap* 21(8): 1–117.
- Agardh, J.G. (1901) *Species genera et ordines algarum, seu descriptiones succinctae specierum, generum et ordinum, quibus algarum regnum constituitur. Vol. tertii, pars quarta. De Florideis Mantissa collectanea tum de speciebus novis aut aliter interpretandis commentaria, tum indicea sistens specierum antea seorsim descriptarum*. C.W.K. Gleerup, Lund, 149 pp.

- Ainouz, I.L. & Sampaio, A.H. (1991) Screening of Brazilian marine algae for hemagglutinins. *Botanica Marina* 34: 211–214.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1515/botm.1991.34.3.211>
- Altschul, S.F., Gish, W., Miller, W., Myer, E.W. & Lipman, D.J. (1990) Basic local alignment search tool. *Journal of Molecular Biology* 215: 403–410.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0022-2836\(05\)80360-2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0022-2836(05)80360-2)
- Areschoug, J.E. (1854) *Phyceae novae et minus cognitae in maribus extraeuropaeis collectae*. [Series 3] *Nova Acta Regiae Societatis Scientiarum Upsaliensis* 1: 329–372.
- Bellorin, A.M., Oliveira, M.C. & Oliveira, E.C. (2002) Phylogeny and systematics of the marine algal family Gracilariaceae (Gracilariales, Rhodophyta) based on small subunit rDNA and its sequences of Atlantic and Pacific species. *Journal of Phycology* 38: 551–563.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1529-8817.2002.01152.x>
- Benson, D.A., Cavanaugh, M., Clark, K., Karsch-Mizrachi, I., Lipman, D.J., Ostell, J. & Sayers, E.W. (2013) GenBank. *Nucleic Acids Research* 41: 36–42.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/nar/gks1195>
- Bird, C.J., McLachlan, J. & Oliveira Filho, E.C. (1986) *Gracilaria chilensis* sp. nov. (Rhodophyta, Gigartinales), from Pacific South America. *Canadian Journal of Botany* 64: 2928–2934.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1139/b86-387>
- Bird, C.J. & Oliveira Filho, E.C. (1986) *Gracilaria tenuifrons* sp. nov. (Gigartinales, Rhodophyta), a species from the tropical western Atlantic with superficial spermatangia. *Phycologia* 25: 313–320.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.2216/i0031-8884-25-3-313.1>
- Calendini, F. & Martin, J.-F. (2005) PaupUP v1.0.3.1 A free graphical frontend for Paup* Dos software. Available from: <http://www.agromontpellier.fr/sppe/Recherche/JFM/PaupUp/main.htm> (accessed 24 October 2013).
- Chang, C.F. & Xia, B.M. (1976) Studies on Chinese species of *Gracilaria*. *Studia Marina Sinica* 11: 91–166.
- Costa, E.S., Plastino, E.M., Petti, R., Oliveira, E.C. & Oliveira, M.C. (2012) The Gracilariaceae Germplasm Bank of the University of São Paulo, Brazil—a DNA barcoding approach. *Journal of Applied Phycology* 24(6): 1–11.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10811-012-9828-y>
- Dawson, E.Y. (1949) Studies of northeast Pacific Gracilariaceae. *Allan Hancock Foundation Publications* 7: 1–105.
- Dawson, E.Y. (1954) Notes on tropical Pacific marine algae. *Bulletin of the Southern California Academy of Sciences* 53: 1–7.
- De Toni, G.B. (1903) *Sylloge algarum omnium hucusque cognitarum*. Vol. IV. *Florideae. Sectio III*. Patavii [Padua]: Sumptibus auctoris, 1525 pp.
- Dickie, G. (1874) On the marine algae of Barbados. *Journal of the Linnean Society of London, Botany* 14: 146–152.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8339.1874.tb00304.x>
- Felsenstein J. (1985) Confidence limits on phylogenies: an approach using the bootstrap. *Evolution* 39: 783–91.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2408678>
- Ferreira-Correia, M.M. (1987) Rodófitas marinhas bentônicas do litoral oriental do Estado do Maranhão. *Coleção Ciências Biológicas, Série Botânica* 1: 1–256.
- Fredericq, S. & Hommersand, M.H. (1989) Comparative morphology and taxonomic status of *Gracilariopsis* (Gracilariales, Rhodophyta). *Journal of Phycology* 25: 228–241.
- Freshwater, D.W. & Rueness, J. (1994) Phylogenetic relationships of some European *Gelidium* (Gelidiales, Rhodophyta) based on analysis of plastid *rbcL* nucleotide sequences. *Journal of Phycology* 31: 616–632.
- Ganesan, E.K. (1994) Morphology and taxonomy of the little-known species *Gracilaria cuneata* J. E. Areschoug (Gracilariales: Rhodophyta) from Venezuela. *Caribbean Journal of Science* 30(1–2): 124–129
- Gmelin, S.G. (1768) *Historia Fucorum*. Academia Scientiarum, Saint Petersburg, 155 pp.
- Greville, R.K. (1830) *Algae britannicae*, or descriptions of the marine and other inarticulated plants of the British islands, belonging to the order Algae; with plates illustrative of the genera. MacLachlan & Stewart, Edinburgh; Baldwin & Cradock, London, 218 pp.
- Guindon, S., Dufayard, J.-F., Lefort, V., Anisimova, M., Hordijk, W. & Gascuel, O. (2010) New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Systematic Biology* 59(3): 307–321.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syq010>
- Gurgel, C.F.D. & Fredericq, S. (2004) Systematics of Gracilariaceae (Gracilariales, Rhodophyta): a critical assessment based on *rbcL* sequence analyses. *Journal of Phycology* 40: 138–159.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.0022-3646.2003.02-129.x>
- Gurgel, C.F.D., Fredericq, S. & Norris, J.N. (2004) Molecular systematics and taxonomy of flattened species of *Gracilaria* Greville (Gracilariaceae, Gracilariales, Rhodophyta) from the Western Atlantic. In: Abbott, I.A. & McDermid, K.J. (Ed.) *Taxonomy of economic seaweeds, with reference to the Pacific and other locations*. Vol. IX. Hawaii Sea Grant College Program, University of Hawaii, Honolulu, HI, USA, pp. 159–199.
- Gurgel, C.F.D., Fredericq, S., Norris, J.N. & Yoneshigue-Valentin, Y. (2008) Two new flat species of *Gracilaria* (Gracilariales, Rhodophyta)

- from Brazil: *G. abyssalis* sp. nov. and *G. brasiliensis* sp. nov. *Phycologia* 47(3): 249–264.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.2216/PH06-59.1>
- Gurgel, C.F.D., Liao, L.M., Fredericq, S. & Hommersand, M.H. (2003) Systematics of *Gracilariopsis* (Gracilariales, Rhodophyta) based on *rbcL* sequence analyses and morphological evidence. *Journal of Phycology* 39: 154–171.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1529-8817.2003.02046.x>
- Hall, T.A. (1999) BioEdit: a user-friendly biological sequence alignment editor and analysis program for Windows 95/98/NT. *Nucleic Acids Symposium Series* 41: 95–98.
- Howe, M.A. (1918) Algae. In: Britton, N.L. (Ed.) *Flora of Bermuda (illustrated)*. Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, pp. 489–540.
- Howe, M.A. (1920) Algae. In: Britton, N.L. & Millspaugh, C.F. (Eds.) *The Bahama flora*. New York, pp. 553–618.
- Hoyle, M.D. (1977) *Gracilaria dotyi* sp. nov. (Rhodophyta, Gigartinales): a new intertidal species from Oahu, Hawaiian Islands. *Pacific Science* 31: 85–89.
- Joly, A.B., Cordeiro-Marino, M., Ugadim, Y., Yamaguishi-Tomita, N. & Pinheiro, F.C. (1965) New marine algae from Brazil. *Arquivos da Estação de Biologia Marinha da Universidade Federal do Ceará* 5(2): 79–92.
- Kimura, M. (1980) A simple method for estimating evolutionary rate of base substitutions through comparative studies of nucleotide sequences. *Journal of Molecular Evolution* 16: 111–120.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF01731581>
- Kützing, F.T. (1869) *Tabulae phycologicae; oder, Abbildungen der Tange*. Vol. 19. Nordhausen: Gedruckt auf kosten des Verfassers (in commission bei W. Köhne). 36 pp.
- Lanave, C., Preparata, G., Saccone, C. & Serio, G. (1984) A new method for calculating evolutionary substitution rates. *Journal of Molecular Evolution* 20: 86–93.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF02101990>
- Larkin, M.A., Blackshields, G., Brown, N.P., Chenna, R., McGettigan, P.A., McWilliam, H., Valentin, F., Wallace, I.M., Wilm, A., Lopez, R., Thompson, J.D., Gibson, T.J. & Higgins, D.G. (2007) Clustal W and Clustal X version 2.0. *Bioinformatics* 23: 2947–2948.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btm404>
- Lin, S.M., Fredericq, S. & Hommersand, M.H. (2001) Systematics of the Delesseriaceae (Ceramiales, Rhodophyta) based on LSU rDNA and *rbcL* sequences, including the Phycodroideae, *subfam. nov.* *Journal of Phycology* 37: 881–899.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1529-8817.2001.01012.x>
- Littler, D.S. & Littler, M.M. (2000) *Caribbean reef plants. An identification guide to the reef plants of the Caribbean, Bahamas, Florida and Gulf of Mexico*. Offshore Graphics, Washington, 542 pp.
- McLachlan, J. (1979) *Gracilaria tikvahiae* sp. nov. (Rhodophyta, Gigartinales, Gracilariaceae), from the northwestern Atlantic. *Phycologia* 18: 19–23.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.2216/i0031-8884-18-1-19.1>
- Milne, I., Lindner, D., Bayer, M., Husmair, D., McGuire, G., Marshall, D.F. & Wright, F. (2009) TOPALi v2: a rich graphical interface for evolutionary analyses of multiple alignments on HPC clusters and multi-core desktops. *Bioinformatics* 25(1): 126–127.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btn575>
- Montagne, C. (1842) *Bostrychia*. *Dictionnaire Universel d'Histoire Naturelle (Orbigny)* 2: 660–661.
- Norris, R.E. (1994) Notes on some Hawaiian Ceramiaceae (Rhodophyceae), including two new species. *Japanese Journal of Phycology* 42: 149–155.
- Nunes, J.M.C. (2005) *Rodofíceas marinhas bentônicas do Estado da Bahia, Brasil*. Universidade de São Paulo, Instituto de Biociências, São Paulo, 410 pp.
- Ohmi, H. (1956) Contributions to the knowledge of Gracilariaceae from Japan. II. On a new species of the genus *Gracilariopsis* with some considerations on its ecology. *Bulletin of the Faculty of Fisheries Hokkaido University* 6: 271–279.
- Papenfuss, G.F. (1967) Notes on algal nomenclature. V. Various Chlorophyceae and Rhodophyceae. *Phykos* 5: 95–105.
- Pereira, S.M.B., Carvalho, M.F.O., Angeiras, J.A.P., Pedrosa, M.E.B., Oliveira, N.M.B., Torres, J., Gestinari, L.M.S., Cocentino, A.L.M., Santos, M.D., Nascimento, P.R.F. & Cavalcanti, D.R. (2002) Algas marinhas bentônicas do estado de Pernambuco. In: Tabarelli, M. & Silva, J.M.C. (Eds.) *Diagnóstico da Biodiversidade de Pernambuco*. Massangana e SECTMA, Recife, pp. 97–124.
- Pinheiro, F.C. & Joly, A.B. (1966) The sexual male plants of *Gracilaria cearensis* (Joly et Pinheiro) Joly et Pinheiro. *Arquivos da Estação de Biologia Marinha da Universidade Federal do Ceará* 6(2): 131–134.
- Pinheiro-Vieira, F. & Caland-Noronha, M.C. (1971) Atividade antibiótica de algumas algas marinhas do estado do Ceará. *Arquivos de Ciências do Mar* 11(2): 91–93.
- Pinheiro-Vieira, F. & Ferreira, M.M. (1968) Algas marinhas de interesse industrial para o nordeste brasileiro. *Boletim da Estação de Biologia Marinha da Universidade Federal do Ceará* 20: 1–9.
- Posada, D. & Crandall, K.A. (1998) MODELTEST: testing the model of DNA substitution. *Bioinformatics* 14: 817–818.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/14.9.817>
- Ronquist, F. & Huelsenbeck, J.P. (2003) MrBayes 3: Bayesian phylogenetic inference under mixed models. *Bioinformatics* 19: 1572–1574.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btg180>

- Sherwood, A.R., Kurihara, A., Conklin, K.Y., Sauvage, T. & Presting, G.G. (2010) The Hawaiian Rhodophyta Biodiversity Survey (2006–2010): a summary of principal findings. *BMC Plant Biology* 10: 1–29.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/1471-2229-10-258>
- Sherwood, A.R. & Presting, G.G. (2007) Universal primers amplify a 23S rDNA plastid marker in eukaryotic algae and cyanobacteria. *Journal of Phycology* 43: 605–608.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1529-8817.2007.00341.x>
- Silva, P.C. (1952) A review of nomenclatural conservation in the algae from the point of view of the type method. *University of California Publications in Botany* 25: 241–323.
- Sonder, G. (1845) Nova algarum genera et species, quas in itinere ad oras occidentales Novae Hollandiae, collegit L. Priess, Ph. Dr. *Botanische Zeitung* 3: 49–57.
- Stackhouse, J. (1802) *Nereis britannica; continens species omnes fucorum in insulis britannicis crescentium: descriptione latine et anglico, necnon iconibus ad vivum depictis. Fasc. 3.* Bathoniae [Bath] & Londini [London]: S. Hazard; J. White. pp. 71–112.
- Steenstoft, M., Irvine, L.M. & Farnham, W.F. (1995) Two terete species of *Gracilaria* and *Gracilariopsis* (Gracilariales, Rhodophyta) in Britain. *Phycologia* 34: 113–127.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.2216/i0031-8884-34-2-113.1>
- Swofford, D.L. (2002) *PAUP*: phylogenetic analysis using parsimony (*and other methods)*. Version 4.0, beta release version 10. Sinauer Associates, Sunderland, MA, USA, 142 pp.
- Tamura, K., Stecher, G., Peterson, D., Filipsk, A. & Kumar, S. (2013) MEGA6: Molecular evolutionary genetics analysis version 6.0. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 30(12): 2725–2729.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/molbev/mst197>
- Taylor, W.R. (1960) *Marine algae of the eastern tropical and subtropical coasts of the Americas*. The University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor, 870 pp.
- Thiers, B. (2014) *Index Herbariorum: A global directory of public herbaria and associated staff*. New York Botanical Garden's Virtual Herbarium. Available from: <http://sweetgum.nybg.org/ih/> (accessed 27 August 2014).
- Tsuda, R.T. & Abbott, I.A. (1985) Collecting, handling, preservation, and logistics. In: Littler, M.M. & Littler, D.S. (Eds.) *Handbook of phycological methods: ecological field methods: macroalgae*, vol. 4. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, pp. 67–86.
- Vahl, M. (1802) Endeel kryptogamiske Planter fra St.-Croix. *Skrifter af Naturhistorie-Selskabet. Kiøbenhavn* 5(2): 29–47.
- Zhao, X., Pang, S., Shan, T. & Liu, F. (2013) Applications of three DNA barcodes in assorting intertidal red macroalgal flora in Qingdao, China. *Journal of Ocean University of China* 12: 139–145.